

# **REPORT OF THE INCLUSIVE PUBLIC SAFETY WORKING GROUP (FALL TERM 2020)**

**December 15, 2020**

## Welcome

During the Summer of 2020, national attention turned with heightened focus to the destructive effects of anti-Black racism in American society. Prompted initially by the killing of George Floyd and many other unarmed African Americans, renewed attention was brought to the ways in which race affects individuals' experiences of safety and law enforcement. Within Columbia, President Bollinger addressed the University's commitment to anti-racism, recognizing that the University is rightly being called upon to do more and to begin again to take action to challenge the deep injustices of racism and of anti-Black racism in particular.

In setting out his agenda for the University community, President Bollinger asked that a working group be formed with this charge: *To work with the leadership of our Office of Public Safety to examine existing trainings and practices and to recommend concrete strategies for ensuring that we can have truly inclusive public safety for all who are on Columbia's campuses.*

At the outset, we recognize with appreciation that Working Group members have been generous with their time, ideas, experiences and expertise in service of this larger call to action for the Columbia community. A special acknowledgement and thanks are owed to the Public Safety Department's leadership, whose transparency and openness to partnership and growth has been invaluable in the process.

This Report reflects the Working Group's efforts to date, organized into the following sections, with an Appendix that includes detailed reports from the group's three subcommittees.

- Mission and Goals (p. 2)
- Working Group Composition, Structure and Process (p. 2)
- Vision for Inclusive Public Safety (p. 4)
- Background on Columbia's Office of Public Safety (p. 5)
- Observations and Recommendations (p. 8)
- Next Steps (p.14)
- Appendix A: Data-Gathering Subcommittee Progress Report
- Appendix B: Training and Other Capacity-Building Subcommittee Report
- Appendix C: Comparative Research Subcommittee Report
- Appendix D: Membership, Inclusive Public Safety Working Group
- Appendix E: Membership, Subcommittees
- Appendix F: Meeting Agendas, Inclusive Public Safety Working Group

In addition to this Report, the Working Group has posted its meeting notes and other materials throughout the semester to ensure that its work is easily available to interested community members. All of this information can be accessed on the Office of University Life's [Inclusive Public Safety Working Group web pages](#).

Each of the sections below can be read as both an update and an invitation to readers to continue and deepen the conversation about inclusive public safety with the wider Columbia community. Ensuring a truly inclusive community, including with respect to public safety, requires sustained attention and engagement from many students, faculty and staff in the short and long term, and the Working Group expects to continue its work through this academic year. We welcome additional questions, perspectives and suggestions as we move ahead.

### **Working Group Mission and Goals**

As described above, the Working Group's charge from President Bollinger is to work with the leadership of Columbia's Department of Public Safety to examine existing training and practices, and to recommend concrete strategies to ensure truly inclusive public safety for all who are on Columbia's campuses.

To fulfill this charge, the Working Group has benefited from the opportunity to learn in greater depth about the role and function of Columbia's Department of Public Safety. In turn, this Report provides an opportunity for the Working Group to share this information with the broader University community.

The Working Group also has focused on learning from students, faculty and staff at Columbia and elsewhere about their experiences and ideas and will continue to offer opportunities for current Columbia community members, recent alums and campus neighbors to share their experiences and ideas to support inclusive public safety at Columbia.

### **Composition, Structure and Process of the Working Group**

This section addresses the Working Group's membership along with the major steps taken since the first convening.

#### *Membership*

The Working Group includes students, faculty and staff from a variety of schools and central offices on the Morningside and Medical Center campuses, as well as members of Public Safety's leadership team. Members were nominated by Deans and other University leaders. The membership list is attached to this Report (Appendix D) and is available on University Life's Inclusive Public Safety Working Group web pages.

The group is co-chaired by Suzanne B. Goldberg, Executive Vice President for University Life, and Flores Forbes, Associate Vice President for Government and Community Affairs, who have worked closely throughout this process with Jim McShane, Vice President for Public Safety.

## *Structure*

Beginning in September 2020, the Working Group met on a biweekly basis throughout the Fall term and held additional subcommittee meetings to advance the work in priority areas. Full-group meetings took place on September 11 and 25, October 9 and 23, November 6 and 20, and December 4, 2020 (Appendix F).

Initial meetings focused on developing a shared understanding of the elements of inclusive public safety (see below). Work then proceeded in subcommittees with a focus on three key issue areas:

- Data Gathering
- Training and Other Capacity Building
- Comparative Research

Each subcommittee conducted research and produced a report with initial findings and recommendations for the full Working Group's consideration—and more broadly, for feedback from the wider Columbia community. Key points from these reports are summarized here, and the full subcommittee reports, including guiding principles and work to date, are attached in Appendices A, B and C.

The *Data-Gathering* subcommittee's charge was to collect experiences, ideas and suggestions from members of the University community related to inclusive public safety, using multiple modalities (individual interviews, focus groups, online submissions) to reach a broad and diverse group of Columbia community members as well as to solicit experiences and suggestions from Public Safety team members.

The *Training and Other Capacity-Building* subcommittee's charge was to examine training practices for Public Safety officers and supervisors. Members attended Public Safety trainings, with the goal of understanding and assessing the training program's impact on an officer's ability to interact effectively with diverse groups and individuals on and near Columbia's campuses, and to identify core areas for improvement to support inclusive public safety on campus.

The *Comparative Research* subcommittee's charge was to gather concrete examples of innovative and promising practices from other higher-education institutions and settings to learn in more depth about the ways in which inclusive public safety practices might be adapted for Columbia University.

## **A Vision for Inclusive Public Safety**

### *Creating a Shared Definition*

Defining “inclusive public safety” has been foundational to the Working Group’s ability to meet its charge, and group members engaged in robust discussion of what inclusive public safety might look and feel like to members of diverse groups within the Columbia community. The group recognized that safety has many components, including the ways in which students, faculty and staff interact on and off campus.

These conversations were held with careful consideration of the broader context in which Columbia is situated: Our campuses do not exist within a vacuum but instead are spaces within New York City where students, faculty and staff from throughout the United States and the world come together, along with members of local communities. Each of these stakeholders brings their own views and experiences, which for some include concerns about both safety and law enforcement. Although Columbia’s Public Safety officers are not sworn law-enforcement officers (i.e. they do not carry weapons or possess the power to arrest), community members’ concerns and experiences may also inform their interactions with and perceptions of Public Safety. These concerns and experiences shape Public Safety’s work, and need to be taken into account.

Based on these discussions, the Working Group developed a definition of inclusive public safety and posted this definition to the Inclusive Public Safety Working Group website. We see this as a working definition—and as an invitation for further thought and conversation within the University community.

### ***Inclusive Public Safety: A Working Definition***

Inclusive Public Safety is Columbia University’s commitment to ensure that the work done to protect the safety of all on our campuses is carried out in a way that:

- treats every person with dignity and respect
- takes a proactive approach to addressing racism, including specialized efforts to counter racial profiling, disparities in treatment and all forms of bias
- recognizes that some members of Columbia’s diverse community, including those who are African American, Afro Latinx, or from other Black communities, along with Indigenous people and other people of color, may have heightened concerns about Public Safety operations, based on experiences with and concerns about race-related profiling, abuses of power and violence by law enforcement
- acknowledges that different communities have varying needs in relationship to safety and feeling safe on campus
- responds thoughtfully and effectively to these concerns

- supports regular evaluation of this work, with both internal and community-based opportunities to participate
- adheres to its values of Pride, Professionalism and Service by providing a diverse and well-trained public safety team that can be responsive and sensitive to the wide variety of community members that it serves.

### **Background on Columbia's Department of Public Safety**

Developing shared knowledge about the work of Columbia's Department of Public Safety has been essential for the Working Group to carry out its mission. This process included discussion and presentations from Public Safety leadership, which filled gaps in understanding that had existed for many members. With the view that similar gaps in understanding may exist within the wider Columbia community, the Working Group has opted to include information about Public Safety's mission, staffing and responsibilities in this Report. This view also informs a recommendation later in this Report regarding enhanced educational efforts and other opportunities for Columbia community members to learn about Public Safety's role and to provide Public Safety with ongoing feedback.

The Working Group had two formal presentations about Public Safety's scope in addition to ongoing discussion throughout the Fall term meetings:

- Vice President for Public Safety Jim McShane provided an overview of Public Safety's role and responsibilities. [That presentation is available here](#) and on the Inclusive Public Safety Working Group webpages.
- Al Becker, Public Safety's Executive Director for Finance and Administration, Matthew Childress Assistant Director for Training and Development, and Tamesha Steward, Manager of Training led a discussion about Public Safety's training programs. [That presentation is available here](#) and on the Inclusive Public Safety Working Group's webpages.

### ***Public Safety's Mission***

The mission of the Columbia University Department of Public Safety is to enhance the quality of life for the entire Columbia community by maintaining a secure and open environment where the safety of all is balanced with the rights of the individual.

### ***Public Safety Staffing and Duties***

- [Columbia's Public Safety](#) is a department within [Columbia University Facilities and Operations](#). It has responsibility for the Morningside, Manhattanville and Medical Center Campuses. Barnard College and Teachers College have their own safety and security services.

- Columbia’s Public Safety Department consists of 287 employees (proprietary officers and uniformed supervisors), and close to 200 contract officers who are assigned to Public Safety Operations across all three of Columbia’s campuses. Proprietary officers are Columbia University employees. Contract officers are provided through an agency that hires, trains and assigns security and safety officers, including for Columbia.
- Public Safety officers are unsworn and unarmed; this means they do not have powers of arrest, nor do they carry weapons. There is a small number of Public Safety personnel (11 total) who are designated as ‘Special Patrolman’ under New York law and, as a result, have the authority to make arrests. The 11 personnel include three security officers so designated as required by the TWU (Union) Agreement as well as 8 supervisors. None is armed and none has ever been asked to make an arrest.
- Public Safety officers’ duties include access control (e.g. entrances to buildings), fixed posts (e.g. booths on and off campus), foot, bicycle and mobile patrols.
- A staff of more than 50 Officers of Administration work within the divisions of Operations, Investigations, Technology, Special Events, and Administrative support.

**Public Safety Department Staff Breakdown:**

<b>Breakdown by Race + Ethnic Identity</b>		
	<b>Total</b>	<b>Percentage</b>
<b>Asian</b>	14	5%
<b>Black</b>	100	35%
<b>Hispanic</b>	114	40%
<b>White</b>	47	16%
<b>Undisclosed</b>	12	4%
<b>Total</b>	287	
<b>Breakdown by Gender Identity</b>		
<b>Male</b>		83%
<b>Female</b>		17%

**Public Safety Training Components:**

Training is an important component of the Public Safety Department’s mission:

- All uniformed public safety personnel receive comprehensive training.
- All newly hired proprietary officers and supervisors receive:
  - 80 - 120 hours of classroom training on University policy and Public Safety procedures.
  - 240 hours of on-the-job campus orientation training among the three Columbia campuses.
- During the classroom training, stakeholders from various University departments present lectures on implicit bias, crisis intervention, de-escalation, equal employment

and affirmative action, diversity, multicultural and gender sensitivity, gender-based misconduct and Title IX.

- In addition to new-hire training, Public Safety conducts various in-service training throughout the year, including eight hours annually of New York State-mandated training for security officers.

*See the Observations section below for additional information about training and other capacity-building, including for contract officers.*

### ***Department of Public Safety Charge and Scope of Responsibilities:***

The Department of Public Safety members are trained as “Customer Service Ambassadors” for the University and do much more than security work. On a daily basis, Department members have contact with and assist hundreds of members of the public and Columbia community in many ways, including:

- Providing guidance and support if a community member is a victim of a crime
- Providing students who may be having dangerous or harmful thoughts with someone to talk with or directing them to the proper qualified medical personnel
- Providing directions and wayfinding for people on campus

In addition, Public Safety provides crime prevention support, including through the following programs and resources:

- VIA Rideshare Point to Point Service
- Safe Havens
- Emergency Call Boxes throughout campus
- Self Defense Classes
- Crime Prevention Seminars
- Anti-theft Devices for Sale at Cost

Further, the Department of Public Safety works to ensure that it complies with various federal laws that govern higher education institutions. These responsibilities include:

- Text Messaging and Crime Alerts to the Columbia Community (as required by the Clery Act)
- Crime reporting
- Campus Security Authority training
- Fire data reporting
- Daily crime and fire logs
- Timely warning notices
- Emergency Preparedness measures



## Observations and Recommendations

This section sets out the initial observations and recommendations of the Working Group, drawing from the work of the three subcommittees – Data-Gathering, Training and Other Capacity-Building, and Comparative Research – along with discussions among the Working Group as a whole. For more context, the subcommittee reports can be reviewed in Appendices A, B and C. As work continues through the academic year, the points here will be supplemented and revised as needed. As with the other sections of this Report, we invite readers to share questions and suggestions.

### Observations

#### **Columbia community members' knowledge about Public Safety and experiences of safety:**

- Columbia's Public Safety Department has a broad scope of work and provides a wide variety of services to students, faculty, staff and surrounding community members, as described above.
- Columbia's Public Safety operates independently from the Public Safety units of the University's affiliates: Barnard College, Teachers College, the Union Theological Seminary and the Jewish Theological Seminary, all of which have their own safety and security services.
- There appear to be significant gaps in Columbia community members' knowledge about Columbia's Public Safety Department, including the scope of Public Safety's responsibilities and daily activities, the training that officers receive and the relationship between Public Safety and the New York City Police Department. There is also a common misunderstanding that Columbia's Public Safety oversees all safety and security across Barnard, Teachers College and the two affiliated seminaries. It does not.
- Many factors affect individuals' and group's experiences of safety, including prior or ongoing experiences with law enforcement in New York City and elsewhere. Some Columbia community members have heightened concern about interacting with Public Safety officers as a result of these experiences. In addition, some students, faculty and staff are unsure of how best to express these concerns to the Department or report incidents related to interactions with Columbia Public Safety officers. Public Safety's website provides a [mechanism to offer feedback](#) or express concerns, although this may not be well known to many in the community. Some Columbia community members are also unsure of what happens with reports and feedback received by the Department.
- Given the variation among individuals' experiences within the Columbia community, the Working Group has made and will continue to make an intentional

and concerted effort to solicit perspectives and feedback on the topic of inclusive public safety from a wide range of perspectives and stakeholders.

### ***Training and other capacity-building within Public Safety***

***For more detailed information, including about the process of reviewing and assessing trainings, see the report of the Training and Other Capacity-Building subcommittee at Appendix C.***

- Columbia University's Public Safety Department delivers public safety services all day and night throughout the year across three campuses: Morningside, Manhattanville, and the Columbia University Irving Medical Center. The cost of this extensive and continuous staffing is substantial, and the University meets this need with two types of officers: "proprietary personnel," who work directly for the University, and "contract officers" provided through a contract with Allied Universal Security Services, which helps to fulfill the broader security needs of the institution.
- The Training and Development Team within Public Safety oversees training plans and implementation. This Team has built an extensive training plan for new employees with the goal that all uniformed personnel receive comprehensive training.
- All new hires of proprietary personnel, both officers and supervisors, receive between 80-120 hours of classroom training on University policy and Public Safety procedures. This in-person training is followed by 240 hours of on-the-job training. These training offerings are in addition the annual mandated 8-hour training required by New York State. Contract officers receive 24 hours of new-hire training mandated by New York State, 4 hours of pre-assignment training from Allied Universal and 4 hours of Columbia specific training in these areas: Equal Opportunity and Affirmative Action, Implicit Bias and Racial Profiling, Use of Force Policy, and Crisis Intervention and De-escalation.
- Proprietary officers tend to remain with the University for longer periods of time than contract officers, and there can be high turnover among contract officers, although some contract officers have worked at Columbia for many years.
- Both contract officers and proprietary officers serve in guard booths and building access roles where they have a high degree of interaction with Columbia affiliates and members of the broader community.

### ***Learning from other institutions***

***For more detailed information, including about the process for gathering information from other institutions, see the report of the Comparative Research subcommittee at Appendix B.***

- ***De-escalation and crisis response:*** A common theme that arose in discussions with other universities is the importance of strengthening the approach to de-escalation and other responses to student crises, including mental health crises where race is a relevant factor.
- ***Uniforms:*** Another theme involves the choices made about when and where public safety officers will wear uniforms or, as an alternative, polo shirts and blazers that officers already wear at selected posts at CUIMC. The CUIMC choice has been well received.
  - For some, the choice about uniforms may affect perceptions of Public Safety including by suggesting a link to uniformed law-enforcement officers.
- ***Event security:*** Universities vary in their approaches to public safety staffing of student events. Some schools rely on their public safety offices to make decisions about staffing, while others rely primarily on student affairs or other staff to make staffing determinations.
- ***“Community approach”:*** Some schools have a “community/integrated” approach to Public Safety to strengthen trust-building with students and other community members. In at least one peer institution, the structure for building these kinds of community relationships between students and staff includes assigning a specific officer to each undergraduate residence and various centers around campus.
- ***Transparency and accountability:*** Some schools have taken additional steps to increase transparency as a way of increasing the community’s trust. In addition to the observations above, this is done in various schools through openness and outreach regarding protocols, trainings, and other areas of work.

## Recommendations

The recommendations here build on discussions within the Working Group and the information and observations presented above and in the subcommittee reports. These recommendations are works in progress that will be supplemented as the Inclusive Public Safety Working Group continues its work in the Spring term.

In particular, the Data-Gathering Subcommittee has begun the important task of gathering a range of perspectives and experiences from Columbia community members and recent alums through individual interviews, focus groups and a [web form](#) that was circulated to all Columbia students, faculty and staff. The subcommittee will continue this work, which will in turn inform these and other recommendations going forward.

### **Broadening awareness of Public Safety's work on and near campus**

- The Working Group will continue to partner with Public Safety leadership to identify new and ongoing opportunities to strengthen awareness within the Columbia community of the full scope of Public Safety's work on campus. The Office of University Life will provide ongoing assistance with this effort.

### **Creating a structure for ongoing work on inclusive public safety**

- The Working Group recommends that a standing Advisory Board be created with students, faculty and staff, convened by Public Safety in conjunction with the Office of University Life. This board would provide a valuable mechanism for the Department to receive new ideas and ongoing feedback, hear of general and specific concerns, and have a sounding board for new ideas for engaging with the broader University community.

### **Building on the Strengths of the Existing Training Program and Enhancing Training and other Capacity-Building Activities**

- *Communicating Public Safety's Accomplishments:* Through its training program, Public Safety has already begun the critical work of orienting new officers to the culture and core values of an inclusive community that is built on respect. The Working Group recommends that the Department develop a more robust communications plan to share the extent of the Department's training efforts with the broader Columbia community, and hopes that this Report will shine a light on the extensive work already underway. As part of this plan, and because community awareness and engagement can contribute to a sense of inclusive public safety across the University, the Working Group also recommends that the Department create additional opportunities for community input on the training offerings.
- *Supporting Contract Officers' Acculturation and Retention:* Given the different levels of training currently available to proprietary and contract personnel, and the contrasting retention rates in these groups, the Working Group recommends that Public Safety takes two actions:

- Find additional ways to strengthen the acculturation of all contract officers in the elements of inclusive public safety, including specific training about effective customer service at Columbia. The Working Group recommends that this include development of an enhanced training in Columbia-specific critical skills and values for online implementation, and ensuring that contract officers who are new to the Columbia community complete this training prior to service on campus.
- Identify posts currently staffed by contract officers that are high-traffic and high-sensitivity, such as residence halls and front-desk staff in academic buildings, and
  - a) seek to ensure that, whenever possible, these posts are staffed either by contract officers with the greatest Columbia-based experience and training or by proprietary officers, all of whom have had extensive Columbia-specific training as part of their onboarding;
  - b) take concrete steps to increase the acculturation of all contract officers in these roles in elements of inclusive public safety, including specific training about effective customer service at Columbia.

The Working Group also observes that it may be beneficial to increase the number of proprietary officers in these roles and recommends further exploration of this.

- *Periodic review of training curricula related to the elements of inclusive public safety:* The Working Group recommends that the Advisory Board described above partner with Public Safety to identify on- or off-campus experts to provide periodic review of existing training and preview new training offerings to ensure that best practices in diversity, equity and inclusion are incorporated into the curriculum as this work changes and advances.
- *Leadership of training in elements of inclusive public safety with affiliated schools:* Recognizing the close connections among the schools affiliated with Columbia, it may be useful to have some shared training of public safety officers across the institutions on topics related to inclusive public safety, such as implicit bias and diversity and inclusion. The Working Group recommends that Public Safety consider using existing coordination committees to explore and possibly implement this approach.

### **Additional recommendations for further discussion**

The following recommendations for further discussion follow from research and discussion within the Comparative Research Subcommittee, which considered innovations and promising practices at peer institutions. These recommendations include suggestions, as appropriate, for the stakeholders who might be involved in exploring these ideas.

For all of these recommendations, the Working Group recommends continued consideration of promising and best practices currently in use at other higher-education institutions.

- *De-escalation:* The Working Group recommends that additional discussion take place among Public Safety leadership, Student Affairs staff, and students to strengthen the approach to student mental health crises and other sensitive situations that require de-escalation. The Working Group notes that some of these conversations are already planned. The aim of these discussions would be to consider innovations in training, dispatch strategies, the potential for mental health professionals, public safety staff, student affairs staff, and students to assist in de-escalation, and other promising and best practices.
- *Uniforms:* The Working Group recommends further discussion, either within the Working Group or with the proposed Advisory Board, regarding the use of uniforms by Public Safety officers, particularly for those who staff entrances of undergraduate residence halls, including consideration of how best to foster positive perceptions of officers' functions and powers.
- *Security for student events:* The Working Group recommends further discussion among student affairs staff, students and Public Safety to consider approaches to enhancing transparency and processes for event-safety assessments and staffing.
- *Transparency in addressing complaints and concerns:* The Working Group recommends that the Department explore, both on its own and with the proposed Advisory Board, options for enhancing transparency in how it responds to complaints and concerns.
- *Integrated community safety approach:* The Working Group recommends that further discussion take place among Public Safety, other University Offices and Columbia's schools to consider additional strategies for supporting inclusive public safety, including some of the integrated-community safety approaches in place at other universities, such as having specific officers working with residence halls and other campus centers, that may be effective in building stronger relationships with Public Safety.

### **Next steps: Continuing the work of the Inclusive Public Safety Working Group**

The Working Group has worked closely with the leadership of Public Safety since its first convening in September, and Public Safety's leadership has been generous with their time, insight and resources. The intensive work in the past several months have enabled many steps in information-gathering and analysis to be completed on a fast track.

The work thus far has provided a foundation for ongoing work in several discrete areas as the Working Group continues to explore and consider a range of perspectives, experiences and suggestions. The plans for work in the Spring term include:

- Gathering and analyzing additional data regarding community members' experiences and perceptions related to Public Safety and issues of inclusion at Columbia through focus groups and interviews.
- Exploring restorative justice as a means of resolving some kinds of incidents on campus
- Considering how safety as a concept and an experience that varies for individuals based on racial and other identities, personal experiences and other factors can be better understood by the many stakeholders across Columbia.
- Providing additional opportunities for Columbia community members, including Public Safety, to understand the history and legacies of racism, specifically anti-Black racism.
- Identifying concrete action steps for measuring outcomes of the work described here.

### **Conclusion**

An inclusive approach to public safety is an essential part of Columbia's commitment to anti-racism and is one that benefits from the engagement of all in our community, in addition to leadership from our Department of Public Safety. Special thanks again to the many individuals across Columbia, within the Department of Public Safety, and from other institutions who generously shared their time, personal experiences, expertise and wisdom with the Working Group.

In closing, we are grateful to you for reading this Report and invite you to share your experiences and insights to help fulfill our mission of ensuring truly inclusive public safety for all on Columbia's campuses.

*--The Working Group on Inclusive Public Safety  
(see Appendix D for the membership list)  
(Write to us at [universitylife@columbia.edu](mailto:universitylife@columbia.edu) or use this [web form](#).)*

**Appendix A**

[Data-Gathering Subcommittee Progress Report](#)

**Appendix B**

[Comparative Research Subcommittee Report](#)

**Appendix C**

[Training and Other Capacity-Building Subcommittee Report](#)



**Appendix D****Inclusive Public Safety Working Group**Membership List - Fall 2020

---

**Suzanne Goldberg***Executive Vice President for University Life**Herbert and Doris Wechsler Clinical Professor of Law, Columbia Law School***Flores Forbes***Associate Vice President, Government & Community Affairs**Adjunct Associate Professor of Architecture, Planning and Preservation***Jim McShane***Vice President, Public Safety***Al Becker\*\****Executive Director, Finance and Administration, Public Safety***Amador Centeno***Senior Vice President, Facilities Management, Operations and Planning, CUIMC**Vice Dean for Student Services, CUIMC***Milagro Chavez-Cisneros***Student, Columbia College***Matthew Childress\*\****Assistant Director, Training and Development, Public Safety***Eder Colecio***Student, Mailman School of Public Health***Jarrell Daniels\****Student, School of General Studies**Program Manager, Justice Ambassadors Youth Council in the Center for Justice***Aryn Davis***Student, Fu Foundation School of Engineering & Applied Science**President, Black Students Organization (BSO)***Marlyn Delva***Dean of Students, School of General Studies**Adjunct Assistant Professor of Epidemiology and Sociomedical Sciences, Mailman School of Public Health*

**John Donaldson**

*Mario J. Gabelli Professor of Finance  
Columbia Business School*

**Jorge Farina**

*Executive Director, Technology, Public Safety*

**Rawda Fawaz\***

*Student, Columbia Law School  
Member, Black Law Students Association  
Former co-president, Muslim Law Students Association*

**Donna Fenn**

*Associate General Counsel, Office of the General Counsel*

**Deidre Fuchs**

*Executive Director, Investigations, Public Safety*

**Sandi Garcia**

*Associate Dean for Student Affairs, Mailman School Public Health*

**Jeannine Jennette**

*Executive Director, CUMC Operations, Public Safety*

**Cristen Kromm**

*Dean of Undergraduate Student Life, Columbia College and SEAS*

**Steven Lee-Kong**

*Assistant Professor of Surgery, CUIMC*

**Karma Lowe**

*Assistant Dean, Diversity, Equity and Inclusion, School of Social Work*

**Laila Maher**

*Dean of Student & Alumni Affairs, School of the Arts*

**Noelia Mann**

*Student, School of Social Work*

**Ogo Okolo**

*Student, College of Physicians & Surgeons  
Member, Black and Latino Student Organization (BALSO)*

**Matthew Patashnick**

*Associate Dean for Student and Family Support, Columbia College and SEAS*

**Radhika Patel**

*Chief of Staff, University Life*

**Ethelyn Pugh**

*Student, School of Social Work*

**Yadira Ramos-Herbert**

*Assistant Dean and Dean of Students, Columbia Law School*

**Ixchel Rosal**

*Associate Vice President, Student Life, University Life*

**Josef Sorett**

*Professor of Religion and of African American and African Diaspora Studies  
Chair, Department of Religion*

**Tamesha Steward\*\***

*Manager, Training, Public Safety*

**Susan Sturm**

*George M. Jaffin Professor of Law and Social Responsibility, Columbia Law School  
Provost's Senior Faculty Teaching Scholar*

**Wes Vear**

*Student, College of Physicians & Surgeons*

**Alex Whelan**

*Time Based Media Metadata Librarian  
Columbia University Libraries*

---

*\* Indicates a member of the group who had to resign due to other obligations*

*\*\* Members of Public Safety who are participating in the Training and Other Capacity Building subcommittee*

## Appendix E

### Inclusive Public Safety Working Group Subcommittees

---

#### Data-Gathering

*Charge:* To gather experiences, ideas and suggestions from members of the Columbia community and others related to inclusive public safety at Columbia. This subcommittee will report this data, and any additional analysis, to the full Working Group for use in formulating recommendations. This group will design and carry out data-gathering through multiple modalities (e.g. individual interviews/conversations, focus groups, online submissions), with responsibility to reach a broad and diverse group of Columbia community members and others, including recent alums. A subgroup will be responsible for gathering experiences and suggestions from Public Safety team members. Working Group members who are not part of this subcommittee may be asked to assist in interviewing and focus groups.

#### **Data-Gathering Subcommittee Co-Chairs:**

**Sandi Garcia**

*Associate Dean for Student Affairs, Mailman School Public Health*

**Yadira Ramos-Herbert**

*Assistant Dean and Dean of Students, Columbia Law School*

**Ixchel Rosal**

*Associate Vice President, Student Life, University Life*

#### **Data-Gathering Subcommittee Members:**

**Milagro Chavez-Cisneros**

*Student, Columbia College*

**Eder Colecio**

*Student, Mailman School of Public Health*

**Aryn Davis**

*Student, Fu Foundation School of Engineering & Applied Science  
President, Black Students Organization (BSO)*

**Jorge Farina**

*Executive Director, Technology, Public Safety*

**Flores Forbes**

*Associate Vice President, Government & Community Affairs*

*Adjunct Associate Professor of Architecture, Planning and Preservation*

**Deidre Fuchs**

*Executive Director, Investigations, Public Safety*

**Noelia Mann**

*Student, School of Social Work*

**Jim McShane**

*Vice President, Public Safety*

**Matthew Patashnick**

*Associate Dean for Student and Family Support, Columbia College and SEAS*

**Ethelyn Pugh**

*Student, School of Social Work*

**Josef Sorett**

*Professor of Religion and of African American and African Diaspora Studies*

*Chair, Department of Religion*

**Alex Whelan**

*Time Based Media Metadata Librarian, Columbia University Libraries*

---

## Comparative Research

**Charge:** To gather concrete examples of innovative and promising practices from higher-ed institutions and other fields related to inclusive public safety. This group's work will include interviewing students and colleagues on other campuses and in other settings to learn in depth about how promising practices might be adapted for Columbia. The group will generate a report that encompasses its research and recommendations for consideration by the full Working Group.

**Comparative Research Subcommittee Co-Chairs:****Amador Centeno**

*Senior Vice President, Facilities Management, Operations and Planning, CUIMC  
Vice Dean for Student Services, CUIMC*

**Cristen Kromm**

*Dean of Undergraduate Student Life, Columbia College and SEAS*

**Wes Vear**

*Student, College of Physicians & Surgeons*

**Comparative Research Subcommittee Members:****Suzanne Goldberg**

*Executive Vice President for University Life  
Herbert and Doris Wechsler Clinical Professor of Law, Director of the Sexuality and Gender Law Clinic, Columbia Law School*

**Jeannine Jennette**

*Executive Director, CUMC Operations, Public Safety*

**Laila Maher**

*Dean of Student & Alumni Affairs, School of the Arts*

**Ogo Okolo**

*Student, College of Physicians & Surgeons  
Member, Black and Latino Student Organization (BALSO)*

---

**Training and Other Capacity-Building**

**Charge:** To examine in depth Public Safety's current practices for building capacity to interact effectively with diverse individuals and groups on and near campus, and identify ways to assess and enhance the effectiveness of those practices in supporting inclusive public safety on campus. The group will consider both training and other means of capacity-building. This group will report on its questions, observations and recommendations for consideration by the full Working Group.

**Training and Other Capacity-Building Subcommittee Co-Chairs:****Karma Lowe**

*Assistant Dean, Diversity, Equity and Inclusion, School of Social Work*

**Radhika Patel**

*Chief of Staff, University Life*

**Training and Other Capacity-Building Subcommittee Members:****Al Becker**

*Executive Director, Finance and Administration, Public Safety*

**Marlyn Delva**

*Dean of Students, School of General Studies*

*Adjunct Assistant Professor of Epidemiology and Sociomedical Sciences, Mailman*

*School of Public Health*

**John Donaldson**

*Mario J. Gabelli Professor of Finance*

*Columbia Business School*

**Donna Fenn**

*Associate General Counsel, Office of the General Counsel*

**Steven Lee-Kong**

*Assistant Professor of Surgery, CUIMC*

**Susan Sturm**

*George M. Jaffin Professor of Law and Social Responsibility, Columbia Law School*

*Provost's Senior Faculty Teaching Scholar*

---

**Leadership****Suzanne B. Goldberg**

*Executive Vice President for University Life*

*Herbert and Doris Wechsler Clinical Professor of Law, Columbia Law School*

**Flores Forbes**

*Associate Vice President, Government & Community Affairs*

*Adjunct Associate Professor of Architecture, Planning and Preservation*

**Jim McShane**

*Vice President, Public Safety*

## **Appendix F**

### **Inclusive Public Safety Working Group**

#### Meeting Agendas

---

**September 11, 2020**

**9:30-10:30 AM**

#### **Agenda**

1. Welcome and Charge of the Working Group
2. Charge, Meeting Structure and Deliverables
3. Discussion of Public Safety's Goals for the Working Group
4. Meeting Norms and Discussion of the Types of Work We Will Do
5. Discussion of Goals and Working to Define Inclusive Public Safety

**September 25, 2020**

**9:30-10:30 AM**

#### **Agenda**

1. Welcome New Committee Members
2. Public Safety's Work: A presentation by Jim McShane, VP for Public Safety with Q&A
3. Discussion: Elements of Inclusive Public Safety
4. Next Steps: Subcommittees for the Working Group

**October 9, 2020**

**9:30-10:30 AM**

#### **Agenda**

1. Welcome
2. Public Safety's training program: A presentation and Q&A with Al Becker, Public Safety's Executive Director for Finance and Administration, Matthew Childress, Assistant Director for Training and Development, and Tamesha Steward, Manager of Training
3. Introduction of the working draft on defining Inclusive Public Safety
4. Subcommittees discussions (data-gathering, comparative research, training and capacity building)



**October 23, 2020**

**9:30-10:30 am**

**Agenda**

1. Welcome
2. Brief Discussion of Inclusive Public Safety definition
3. Brief Reports from Subcommittee Chairs
4. Subcommittee meetings in breakout rooms

**Friday, November 6, 2020**

**9:30-10:30 am**

**Agenda**

1. Welcome
2. Brief Reports from Subcommittee Chairs
3. Subcommittee meetings in breakout rooms

**Friday, November 20, 2020**

**9:30-10:30 am**

**Agenda**

1. Welcome
2. Brief reports from Subcommittee Chairs
3. Planning for the Working Group's December report
4. Subcommittee meetings in breakout rooms

**Friday, December 4, 2020**

**9:30-10:30 am**

**Agenda**

1. Welcome
2. Brief reports from Subcommittee Chairs
3. Review of the group's December report draft